



Rewarding Learning

ADVANCED
General Certificate of Education
2019

Religious Studies

Assessment Unit A2 5

assessing

Themes in the Celtic Church, Reformation
and Post-Reformation Church

[ARE51]

TUESDAY 11 JUNE, MORNING

**MARK
SCHEME**

General Marking Instructions

Introduction

The main purpose of a mark scheme is to ensure that examinations are marked accurately, consistently and fairly. The mark scheme provides examiners with an indication of the nature and range of candidates' responses likely to be worthy of credit. It also sets out the criteria which they should apply in allocating marks to candidates' responses.

Assessment objectives

Below are the assessment objectives for **GCE Religious Studies**

Candidates should be able to:

- demonstrate knowledge and understanding of religion, including:
 - religious, philosophical and/or ethical thought and teaching;
 - influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies;
 - cause and significance of similarities and differences in belief, teaching and practice; and
 - approaches to the study of religion and belief (AO1); and
- analyse and evaluate aspects of, and approaches to, religion and belief, including their significance, influence and study (AO2).

Quality of candidates' responses

In marking the examination papers, examiners should be looking for a quality of response reflecting the level of maturity which may reasonably be expected of a 17- or 18-year-old which is the age at which the majority of candidates sit their GCE examinations.

Flexibility in marking

Mark schemes are not intended to be totally prescriptive. No mark scheme can cover all the responses which candidates may produce. In the event of unanticipated answers, examiners are expected to use their professional judgement to assess the validity of answers. If an answer is particularly problematic, then examiners should seek the guidance of the Supervising Examiner.

Positive marking

Examiners are encouraged to be positive in their marking, giving appropriate credit for what candidates know, understand and can do rather than penalising candidates for errors or omissions. Examiners should make use of the whole of the available mark range for any particular question and be prepared to award full marks for a response which is as good as might reasonably be expected of a 17- or 18-year-old GCE candidate.

Awarding zero marks

Marks should only be awarded for valid responses and no marks should be awarded for an answer which is completely incorrect or inappropriate.

Mark schemes for tasks or questions which require candidates to respond in extended written form are marked on the basis of levels of response which take account of the quality of written communication.

Levels of response

In deciding which level of response to award, examiners should look for the 'best fit' bearing in mind that weakness in one area may be compensated for by strength in another. In deciding which mark within a particular level to award to any response, examiners are expected to use their professional judgement.

The following guidance is provided to assist examiners.

- **Threshold performance:** Response which just merits inclusion in the level and should be awarded a mark at or near the bottom of the range.
- **Intermediate performance:** Response which clearly merits inclusion in the level and should be awarded a mark at or near the middle of the range.
- **High performance:** Response which fully satisfies the level description and should be awarded a mark at or near the top of the range.

Each of the two assessment objectives have been categorised into five levels of performance relating to the respective abilities of the candidates. Having identified, for each assessment objective, the band in which the candidate has performed, the examiner should then decide on the appropriate mark within the range for the band.

Other Aspects of Human Experience at AS Level

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience, when required, to access Bands 3–5.

Synoptic Assessment at A2 Level

Candidates must support their answer with reference to at least one other unit of study to access Bands 4–5.

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience in their AO2 response to access Bands 3–5.

Quality of written communication

Quality of written communication is taken into account in assessing candidates' responses to all tasks and questions that require them to respond in extended written form. These tasks and questions are marked on the basis of levels of response. The description for each level of response includes reference to the quality of written communication.

For conciseness, quality of written communication is distinguished within levels of response as follows:

- Level 1: Quality of written communication is basic.
- Level 2: Quality of written communication is limited.
- Level 3: Quality of written communication is good.
- Level 4: Quality of written communication is very good.
- Level 5: Quality of written communication is excellent.

In interpreting these level descriptions, examiners should refer to the more detailed guidance provided below:

Level 1 (Basic): The candidate makes only a basic selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. The organisation of material lacks clarity and coherence. There is little or no use of specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are basic and the intended meaning is not clear.

Level 2 (Limited): The candidate makes a limited selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. The organisation of material may lack clarity and coherence. There is limited use of specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar may be such that intended meaning is not clear.

Level 3 (Good): The candidate makes a reasonable selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. Relevant material is organised with some clarity and coherence. There is good use of appropriate specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are sufficiently competent to make meaning clear.

Level 4 (Very Good): The candidate makes a very good selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. Relevant material is organised with clarity and coherence. There is very good use of appropriate specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are of a very good standard to make meaning clear.

Level 5 (Excellent): The candidate successfully selects and uses the most appropriate form and style of writing. Relevant material is organised with a high degree of clarity and coherence. There is widespread and accurate use of appropriate specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are of a sufficiently high standard to make meaning clear.

Band	AO1 Performance Descriptors	Marks
5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • An excellent response to the question asked. • Demonstrates comprehensive understanding and knowledge. • Demonstrates a comprehensive understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies. • A very high degree of relevant evidence, examples and scholarship. • A sophisticated answer with a clear and coherent structure. • An extensive range of technical language and vocabulary with accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[17]–[20]
4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A very good response to the question asked. • Demonstrates a high degree of understanding and almost totally accurate knowledge. • Demonstrates a high degree of understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies. • A very good range of relevant evidence, examples and scholarship. • A mature answer with a mainly clear and coherent structure. • A very good use of technical language and vocabulary with a mainly accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[13]–[16]
3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A good response to the question asked. • Demonstrates a reasonable degree of understanding and mainly accurate knowledge. • Demonstrates a reasonable degree of understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies. • A good range of relevant evidence, examples and scholarship. • A reasonably mature answer with some evidence of structure and coherence. • A good use of technical language and vocabulary with a reasonably accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[9]–[12]
2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A limited response to the question asked. • Demonstrates limited knowledge and understanding. • Demonstrates limited understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies. • A limited range of evidence, examples and scholarship. • A limited answer with limited evidence of structure and coherence. • A limited use of technical language and vocabulary with a limited command of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[5]–[8]
1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A basic response to the question asked. • Demonstrates minimal knowledge and understanding. • Demonstrates minimal understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies. • Little, if any, use of evidence, examples and scholarship. • A basic answer with basic structure and coherence. • A basic use of technical language and vocabulary with a poor grasp of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[1]–[4]

Band	AO2 Performance Descriptors	Marks
5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A comprehensive and coherent response demonstrating an excellent attempt at critical analysis. • An excellent attempt to evaluate aspects of, and approaches to, religion and belief. • An excellent attempt using evidence, reasoning and scholarship to construct well informed and balanced arguments. • An excellent attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought. • A sophisticated answer with a clear and coherent structure. • An extensive range of technical language and vocabulary with accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[25]–[30]
4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A very good response demonstrating a very good attempt at critical analysis. • A very good attempt to evaluate aspects of, and approaches to, religion and belief. • A very good attempt using evidence, reasoning and scholarship to construct well informed and balanced arguments. • A very good attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought. • A mature answer with a mainly clear and coherent structure. • A very good use of technical language and vocabulary with a mainly accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[19]–[24]
3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A reasonable response demonstrating a good attempt at critical analysis. • A good attempt to evaluate aspects of, and approaches to, religion and belief. • A good attempt using evidence, reasoning and scholarship to construct well informed and balanced arguments. • A good attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought. • A reasonably mature answer with some evidence of structure and coherence. • A good use of technical language and vocabulary with a reasonably accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[13]–[18]
2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A limited response demonstrating a modest attempt at critical analysis. • A limited attempt to evaluate aspects of, and approaches to, religion and belief. • A limited attempt using evidence, reasoning and scholarship to construct well informed and balanced arguments. • A limited attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought. • A limited answer with limited evidence of structure and coherence. • A limited use of technical language and vocabulary with a limited command of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[7]–[12]
1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A basic response demonstrating little attempt at critical analysis. • A basic attempt to evaluate aspects of, and approaches to, religion and belief. • A basic attempt using evidence, reasoning and scholarship to construct well informed and balanced arguments. • A basic attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought. • A basic answer with basic structure and coherence. • A basic use of technical language and vocabulary with a poor grasp of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[1]–[6]

Section A

AVAILABLE
MARKS

Answer **two** questions from this section

- 1 (a) Analyse the dispute between Roman and Celtic Christianity which led to the Synod of Whitby.

Answers may include:

- The dating of Easter.
- Tonsure.
- Sacramental practices, e.g. Episcopal ordination.
- The meeting with Augustine.
- Events in the Northumbrian royal household.
- The role of women.
- Church government and organisation.
- Letters and correspondence between Roman and Celtic Church, e.g. Laurentius of Canterbury.
- Attitudes to authority.
- Attitudes to diversity and uniformity.
- Adaptation to native law.
- Local independence and centralism.
- Views of scholars, e.g. Gougaud, Chadwick, Hughes, Lloyd.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO1)

[20]

(b) “It is impossible to get an accurate picture of what happened at the Synod of Whitby and its outcome.”

Critically assess this claim.

Answers may include:

- The information given by Bede as the main source on Whitby.
- The historical value and reliability of Bede as a source, e.g. bias, exaggeration.
- The main arguments presented at Whitby.
- How the Paschal Controversy was dealt with in Ireland and Europe.
- The relevance of political concerns at Whitby, e.g. the kingdom of Deira.
- The underlying issues at Whitby and their importance.
- The value of local autonomy and importance of local tradition.
- The relevance and importance of Papal Authority at the time.
- The importance of centralisation in the church.
- Conformity and uniformity in the Christian Church.
- The importance of the role and decision of Oswy.
- The response of Colman.
- The standardisation of liturgy and sacraments.
- Changes that resulted from Whitby, e.g. episcopal ordination.
- The impact of Whitby on the church in Ireland.
- The relevance of the first and second Synods of Birr.
- The impact on the authority and influence of the Celtic Church in North Britain, e.g. episcopal ordination and abbacy.
- Events at Iona.
- The influence of Celtic art and learning.
- The impact of Whitby on the structure and organisation of the Celtic Church.
- The views of scholars such as McNeill, Cowdrey, Hughes, Smyth.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO2)

[30]

AVAILABLE
MARKS

50

2 (a) With reference to **two** examples, outline how Columbanus dealt with religious controversy.

AVAILABLE
MARKS

Answers may include:

- Specific reference to **two** examples.
- Correspondence dealing with the dating of Easter, e.g. to the French bishops and Pope Sabinian.
- How Columbanus dealt with controversy, e.g. letters, diplomacy or lack of, outspokenness, respectful of Papacy.
- Abbatial authority, e.g. conflict with Gall.
- Issues of morality, e.g. dispute with King Theuderic.
- The role of the Papacy in the Church.
- The impact of heresy on the Church.
- The sermons of Columbanus.
- Christian Unity.
- The views of scholars, e.g. Dubois, Walker, Metlake, O’Fiaich.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO1)

[20]

(b) To what extent is it true that religious believers should always avoid conflict?

Answers may include:

- The example of Jesus, e.g. in Gethsemane.
- Jesus' relationship with the Roman and Jewish authorities.
- Teachings of Jesus on forgiveness, love of enemies and non-retaliation.
- The impact of war.
- Religious texts on relationship between religion and State, e.g. Romans.
- The beliefs and practices of world religions, e.g. Buddhism.
- Christian pacifism.
- The philosophies of religious figures, e.g. Ghandi, Martin Luther King, Romero.
- Moral responsibility to avoid conflict.
- Religious voice in the public square, e.g. challenge to State on matters of public welfare.
- Holy Wars, e.g. the Crusades, Isis.
- Just War Theory.
- Different religious perspectives, e.g. Quakers, Liberation Theologians.
- Difference between controversy and conflict.
- The impact of the Reformation.
- The right to religious freedom.
- Defence of human rights.
- The work of the ecumenical movement.
- The need for a moral voice on controversial issues, e.g. stem cell research, genetic manipulation.
- Figures such as Pope Francis, Bonhoeffer.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO2)

[30]

50

AVAILABLE
MARKS

3 (a) Clarify the purpose of the Council of Trent.

Answers may include:

- The context of spiritual revival and new religious orders.
- The need for reform from within.
- To reaffirm and clarify Catholic doctrinal teaching, e.g. the real presence in the Eucharist.
- To address clerical discipline and abuses.
- Reaffirmation of Papal Authority.
- To seek unity between Catholics and Protestants.
- To identify and define canonical texts.
- As a reaction to the Protestant Reformation.
- To provide the education of clergy.
- To standardise liturgy.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO1)

[20]

AVAILABLE
MARKS

- (b) “Religious reform is always necessary for the survival of the Church.”
With reference to the Reformation, critically evaluate this statement.

Answers may include:

- The causes of the Protestant Reformation, e.g. simony, indulgences.
- The benefits of the Protestant Reformation to the Christian Church, e.g. vernacular Bible, role of the laity, addressing abuses.
- The impact of the Protestant Reformation on Europe, e.g. wars, division.
- The need for the Counter Reformation.
- The role and contribution of religious orders in reforming the church, e.g. Jesuits.
- The contribution of the council of Trent to reform, e.g. episcopal residency, seminaries, catechism.
- The limitation of reforms at Trent, e.g. failure to achieve Christian unity.
- The purpose of the Second Vatican Council.
- The impact of reforms at Vatican II, e.g. collegiality, role of the laity.
- The failings of Vatican II, e.g. role of women, pace of implementation.
- The importance of religious organisations maintaining relevance.
- The role and value of tradition.
- Reform as the cause of conflict and division.
- Impact of reform in variety of world religions, e.g. Reformed Judaism.
- The role of reform in overcoming and addressing shortcomings, e.g. a Listening Church.
- “Ecclesia semper reformanda est.”
- Contemporary reform in Christian Church, e.g. Pope Francis Synod on Family, reform of Curia.
- The views of scholars, e.g. Gilles, MacCulloch, Gaillardetz, Bokenkotter.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO2)

[30]

Section A

**AVAILABLE
MARKS**

50

100

Synoptic Bands
Total Marks: [20]

Band	AO1 Performance Descriptors	Marks
5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • An excellent attempt at analysis with a full and highly informed response to the question. • Demonstrates comprehensive understanding and accurate knowledge of the themes considering the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies. • A very high degree of relevant evidence, scholarship and exemplification with particular reference to at least one other unit of study. • A sophisticated answer with a clear and coherent structure. • An extensive range of technical language and vocabulary with accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[17]–[20]
4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A very good attempt at analysis with a well informed response to the question. • Demonstrates a high degree of understanding and almost totally accurate knowledge of the themes considering the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies. • A very good range of relevant evidence, scholarship and exemplification with particular reference to at least one other unit of study. • A mature answer with a mainly clear and coherent structure. • A very good use of technical language and vocabulary with a mainly accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[13]–[16]
3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A good attempt at analysis with a reasonably well informed response to the question. • Demonstrates a good understanding and mainly accurate knowledge of the themes considering the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies. • A good range of relevant evidence, scholarship and exemplification with particular reference to at least one other unit of study. • A reasonably mature answer with some evidence of structure and coherence. • A good use of technical language and vocabulary with a reasonably accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[9]–[12]
2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A limited attempt at analysis with a limited response to the question. • Demonstrates a limited understanding and limited knowledge of the themes considering the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies. • A limited range of relevant evidence, scholarship and exemplification with particular reference to at least one other unit of study. • A limited answer with limited evidence of structure and coherence. • A limited use of technical language and vocabulary with a limited command of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[5]–[8]
1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A basic attempt at analysis with a basic response to the question. • Demonstrates a basic understanding and basic knowledge of the themes considering the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies. • A basic range of evidence, scholarship and exemplification with particular reference to at least one other unit of study. • A basic answer with basic structure and coherence. • A basic use of technical language and vocabulary with a poor grasp of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[1]–[4]

Candidates must refer to at least one other unit of study in their AO1 response to access Bands 4–5.

Band	AO2 Performance Descriptors	Marks
5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A comprehensive and coherent response demonstrating an excellent attempt at critical analysis in relation to other aspects of human experience. • An excellent attempt to evaluate aspects of, and approaches to, religion and belief. • An excellent attempt using evidence, reasoning and scholarship to construct well informed and balanced arguments. • An excellent attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought. • A sophisticated answer with a clear and coherent structure. • An extensive range of technical language and vocabulary with accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[25]–[30]
4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A very good response demonstrating a very good attempt at critical analysis in relation to other aspects of human experience. • A very good attempt to evaluate aspects of, and approaches to, religion and belief. • A very good attempt using evidence, reasoning and scholarship to construct well informed and balanced arguments. • A very good attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought. • A mature answer with a mainly clear and coherent structure. • A very good use of technical language and vocabulary with a mainly accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[19]–[24]
3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A reasonable response demonstrating a good attempt at critical analysis in relation to other aspects of human experience. • A good attempt to evaluate aspects of, and approaches to, religion and belief. • A good attempt using evidence, reasoning and scholarship to construct well informed and balanced arguments. • A good attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought. • A reasonably mature answer with some evidence of structure and coherence. • A good use of technical language and vocabulary with a reasonably accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[13]–[18]
2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A limited response demonstrating a modest attempt at critical analysis which struggles to relate to other aspects of human experience. • A limited attempt to evaluate aspects of, and approaches to, religion and belief. • A limited attempt using evidence, reasoning and scholarship to construct well informed and balanced arguments. • A limited attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought. • A limited answer with limited evidence of structure and coherence. • A limited use of technical language and vocabulary with a limited command of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[7]–[12]
1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A basic response demonstrating little attempt at critical analysis which fails to relate to other aspects of human experience. • A basic attempt to evaluate aspects of, and approaches to, religion and belief. • A basic attempt using evidence, reasoning and scholarship to construct well informed and balanced arguments. • A basic attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought. • A basic answer with basic structure and coherence. • A basic use of technical language and vocabulary with a poor grasp of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	[1]–[6]

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience in their AO2 response to access Bands 3–5.

Section B

**AVAILABLE
MARKS**

Synoptic Assessment

You **must** answer this question

- 4 (a)** “Historically, religion has been important in supporting morality in society.”
With reference to **one** example, examine this statement. You must support your answer with reference to at least one other unit of study.

Answers may include:

- Specific reference to one historical example of religion supporting morality in society, e.g. Dutch Reform Church in South Africa.
- The ethical and moral teachings of religious organisations, e.g. abortion, war, the environment.
- The views of fundamentalist religious groups, e.g. the New Christian Right.
- Religious organisations as counter-cultural in secular society.
- Secular sources of morality, e.g. humanism, New Atheism, science.
- The tension between religion and morality, e.g. historical abuse, religious wars, FGM.
- Religion and freedom, e.g. of conscience.
- Separation of religion and temporal matters.
- 1937 Constitution in Republic of Ireland and its influence on divorce, same-sex marriage.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

Candidates must support their answer with reference to at least one other unit of study to access Bands 4–5

(AO1)

[20]

(b) “Religion and State each have their own concerns and responsibilities and for this reason should always remain apart.”
 With reference to other aspects of human experience, critically assess this view.

Answers may include:

- Teaching in Christian Scripture, e.g. Romans.
- The example of Jesus, e.g. question of payment of taxes.
- Teachings of theologians, e.g. Augustine.
- Religious arguments for separation of religion and state, e.g. Anabaptist.
- Relationship between religion and State in a theocracy, e.g. Old Testament, Iran.
- The impact of secularism.
- The relationship between religion and state in a variety of countries, e.g. France, US, Ireland, UK.
- Ideological conflict between religion and State, e.g. Communist China.
- The issue of religious liberty.
- The role of and relationship between religion and politics, e.g. Liberation Theology, House of Lords.
- Religion as a moral arbiter of the State, e.g. on issues of war, poverty, environment.
- The pastoral role of religious organisations, e.g. in alleviating poverty, in war situations.
- The role of religious figures in politics, e.g. Tutu, Romero, Martin Luther King, Ian Paisley (Snr).

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience to access Bands 3–5

(AO2)

[30]

50

Section B

50

Total

150

**AVAILABLE
MARKS**